

9-2019

New perspectives on Pakistan's political economy: state, class and social change

Matthew McCartney

S. Akbar Zaidi
Institute of Business Administration

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ir.iba.edu.pk/faculty-research-books>



Part of the [Political Economy Commons](#), and the [Politics and Social Change Commons](#)

iRepository Citation

McCartney, M., & Zaidi, S. A. (2019). New perspectives on Pakistan's political economy: state, class and social change. Retrieved from <https://ir.iba.edu.pk/faculty-research-books/3>

This document is brought to you by *iRepository*. For more information, please contact irepository@iba.edu.pk.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

This volume makes a major intervention in the debates around the nature of the political economy of Pakistan, focusing on its contemporary social dynamics. This is the first comprehensive academic analysis of Pakistan's political economy after thirty-five years, and addresses issues of state, class and society, examining gender, the middle classes, the media, the bazaar economy, urban spaces and the new elite.

The book goes beyond the contemporary obsession with terrorism and extremism, political Islam, and simple 'civilian–military relations', and looks at modern-day Pakistan through the lens of varied academic disciplines. It not only brings together new work by some emerging scholars but also formulates a new political economy for the country, reflecting the contemporary reality and diversification in the social sciences in Pakistan.

The chapters in this volume dynamically and dialectically capture emergent processes and trends in framing Pakistan's political economy and invite other scholars to engage with and move beyond these concerns and issues.

Matthew McCartney is former Director of South Asian Studies (2011–2018) and Associate Professor in the Political Economy and Human Development of South Asia, University of Oxford. His two most recent books are *Economic Growth and Development: A Comparative Introduction* (2015) and *Pakistan: The Political Economy of Growth, Stagnation and the State, 1951–2008* (2011).

S. Akbar Zaidi is Professor at Columbia University, New York, and is also an Adjunct Professor at the Institute of Business Administration, Karachi. His most recent books are *Issues in Pakistan's Economy: A Political Economy Perspective* (2015) and *Military, Civil Society and Democratization in Pakistan* (2011).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

SOUTH ASIA IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

South Asia has become a laboratory for devising new institutions and practices of modern social life. Forms of capitalist enterprise, providing welfare and social services, the public role of religion, the management of ethnic conflict, popular culture and mass democracy in the countries of the region have shown a marked divergence from known patterns in other parts of the world. South Asia is now being studied for its relevance to the general theoretical understanding of modernity itself.

South Asia in the Social Sciences will feature books that offer innovative research on contemporary South Asia. It will focus on the place of the region in the various global disciplines of the social sciences and highlight research that uses unconventional sources of information and novel research methods. While recognising that most current research is focused on the larger countries, the series will attempt to showcase research on the smaller countries of the region.

General Editor
Partha Chatterjee
Columbia University

Editorial Board
Pranab Bardhan
University of California at Berkeley

Stuart Corbridge
Durham University

Satish Deshpande
University of Delhi

Christophe Jaffrelot
Centre d'études et de recherches internationales, Paris

Nivedita Menon
Jawaharlal Nehru University

Other books in the series:

Government as Practice: Democratic Left in a Transforming India
Dwaipayan Bhattacharyya

Courting the People: Public Interest Litigation in Post-Emergency India
Anuj Bhwania

Development after Statism: Industrial Firms and the Political Economy of South Asia
Adnan Naseemullah

Politics of the Poor: Negotiating Democracy in Contemporary India
Indrajit Roy

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

South Asian Governmentalities: Michel Foucault and the Question of Postcolonial Orderings

Stephen Legg and Deana Heath (eds.)

Nationalism, Development and Ethnic Conflict in Sri Lanka

Rajesh Venugopal

Adivasis and the State: Subalternity and Citizenship in India's Bhil Heartland

Alf Gunvald Nilsen

Maoist People's War and the Revolution of Everyday Life in Nepal

Ina Zharkevich

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

New Perspectives on
Pakistan's Political Economy
State, Class and Social Change

Edited by
Matthew McCartney
S. Akbar Zaidi



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia
314 to 321, 3rd Floor, Plot No.3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108486552

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in India

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-48655-2 HB

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	
Matthew McCartney and S. Akbar Zaidi	<i>ix</i>
Introduction	
<i>Matthew McCartney and S. Akbar Zaidi</i>	1
1. In a Desperate State: The Social Sciences and the Overdeveloped State in Pakistan, 1950 to 1983	25
<i>Matthew McCartney</i>	
2. The Overdeveloped Alavian Legacy	56
<i>Aasim Sajjad Akhtar</i>	
3. Institutions Matter: The State, the Military and Social Class	75
<i>Aqil Shah</i>	
4. Class Is Dead but Faith Never Dies: Women, Islam and Pakistan	93
<i>Afiya Shebrbano Zia</i>	
5. The Amnesia of Genesis	110
<i>Adeem Subail</i>	
6. The Political Economy of Uneven State-Spatiality in Pakistan: The Interplay of Space, Class and Institutions	130
<i>Danish Khan</i>	
7. An Evolving Class Structure? Pakistan's Ruling Classes and the Implications for Pakistan's Political Economy	153
<i>Rosita Armytage</i>	
8. The Segmented 'Rural Elite': Agrarian Transformation and Rural Politics in Pakistani Punjab	176
<i>Muhammad Ali Jan</i>	
9. Ascending the Power Structure: Bazaar Traders in Urban Punjab	199
<i>Umair Javed</i>	

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

viii	Contents
10. Democracy and Patronage in Pakistan <i>Hassan Javid</i>	216
11. From Overdeveloped State to Praetorian Pakistan: Tracing the Media's Transformations <i>Farooq Sulehria</i>	241
<i>About the Contributors</i>	256
<i>Index</i>	261

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Preface

The genesis of this book lies in teaching a course on the economic development of South Asia, at both Oxford University and the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) at the University of London, and in trying to assess and explore ideas about the political economy of regions and states other than those of India. Unlike the rich academic literature on studying India and other countries of the Global South across a variety of schools of thought in economics, politics and political economy, the limited focus on Pakistan has largely been dominated by a single framework, one proposed by Hamza Alavi, which focused on the notion of an overdeveloped state, with regard to Pakistan and, later, Bangladesh, in a paper published in the *New Left Review* in 1972. One option for teaching such a course was to use the comparative nature of scholarship, primarily one based on the Indian academic and social science tradition and historical context, and consider its relevance for Pakistan. However, as academics, researchers and scholars of India, or the other countries which constitute South Asia realise, that while this is how much of the academic teaching and research in and on South Asia usually functions, it is a very suboptimal choice of teaching and scholarship, given the specificities of the different countries. Pakistan, like the other South Asian countries, differs substantially from India, given its political economy and history, and requires an examination based on its own terms and in its own context. While exceptional scholarship of social scientists from India and those who work on India is now increasingly providing theoretical and empirical evidence redefining numerous theoretical paradigms – as we find in this volume as well – what has been lacking for at least four decades now is rigorous assessment of Pakistan's political economy, which, until recently, has continued to be dominated by the work and influence of Hamza Alavi.

In February 2016, Professor Matthew McCartney and his student Muhammad Ali Jan organised a workshop in Oxford sponsored by Wolfson College and the Contemporary South Asian Studies Programme (CSASP) to address this problem and to assess the state of scholarship in the social sciences and of the political economy of Pakistan, almost four-and-a-half decades after Alavi's thesis. Their suggestion was to engage with the call to academic arms made by S. Akbar Zaidi in an essay published in *Economic and Political Weekly* in 2014, in which he argued

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

x

Preface

that one needs to go well beyond the Alavi thesis and considerably re-think Pakistan's political economy in a much changed world and in a very different Pakistan. Soon after publication, Zaidi's *Economic and Political Weekly* essay was critiqued and responded to in the journal by five, mostly younger, scholars from Pakistan in a symposium organised by Majed Akhter, then Assistant Professor in the Department of Geography, Indiana University, Bloomington. Akhter invited Aasim Sajjad Akhtar, Fahd Ali, Umair Javed and Adeem Suhail to engage with Zaidi's intervention. Zaidi responded to the critiques by suggesting they were not 'ruthless enough' and that many of his arguments went 'uncontested'. The five participants in the symposium in the *Economic and Political Weekly* were invited to contribute to this volume, three of whom eventually did, and they have considerably expanded on their original insight as is evident in this collection.

The workshop held in Oxford in February 2016 had ten papers presented for discussion, five of which have been included in this volume. S. Akbar Zaidi delivered the keynote address to the participants in a public lecture around the workshop. Those who presented papers included Adeel Malik and Masooda Bano, both teaching at Oxford University; Faisal Siddiqi, an advocate of the Supreme Court of Pakistan, based in Karachi; Umair Javed, who was just finishing his PhD at the London School of Economics; Afiya Shehribano Zia, a feminist scholar from Karachi; Farooq Sulehria and Matthew Nelson (whose paper was presented in absentia), both from SOAS; Adnan Rafiq and Ali Jan, both of whom were completing their PhDs at Oxford; and Matthew McCartney, who teaches at Oxford University and is responsible for organising the Oxford workshop. Subsequently, Aqil Shah, Danish Khan, Hassan Javid, Aasim Sajjad Akhtar, Rosita Armytage and Adeem Suhail were invited to contribute to this collection in response to the Alavi and Zaidi papers.

Both of us, as editors to this volume, have since negotiated the shoals of getting feedback from the reviewers and going through various iterations of editing. We would like to thank all who participated in the Oxford University Workshop, as well as all the final contributors to this volume. We are delighted to see the stimulating contradictions, debates and rigorous arguments emerging in these chapters. We asked the question whether Pakistan needed a new political economy to go beyond the one originally provided by Alavi. Our contributors have answered this question in a wonderful variety of ways and we see this as the start of a new debate about Pakistan and its political economy.

16 February 2019

Matthew McCartney
University of Oxford

S. Akbar Zaidi
Columbia University and IBA, Karachi

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Excerpt
[More Information](#)

Introduction

Matthew McCartney and S. Akbar Zaidi

This is not a book about Hamza Alavi (1921–2003), the Pakistani Marxist sociologist/anthropologist, but about social science in Pakistan, with a particular focus on its political economy, broadly interpreted. Specifically, this book is trying to understand why, how and with what consequences did one particular theoretical perspective come to exercise such a dominating influence on the analysis of state and society in post-independence Pakistan. There was much brilliant and insightful work done in the 1970s and 1980s on agrarian transition (S. Ahmad 1977; Khan 1975; Khan 1981; Hussain 1980), on industrial concentration (Amjad 1983), ethnicity (Ahmed 1998), and democratisation (A. Ahmad 1985, 2000). Yet it was Alavi's overdeveloped state thesis that dominated discussions and continued to determine how the Pakistani state was envisaged.

One possible explanation why Hamza Alavi's thesis has persisted and dominated, especially in the context of Pakistani scholarship, is the sheer breadth of Alavi's intellectual and practical engagement. Many of the studies and academics mentioned above are essential references confined to relatively narrower terms of engagement and disciplines, but wherever one approaches Pakistan through the broad political economy perspective, one finds that Alavi's pioneering work to be of noted relevance.

Before casting the spotlight on this one intervention, a quick digression on the extraordinary range of Alavi's career and scholarship would be worth our while. After all, he 'was one of the most important intellectuals from the Asian subcontinent to participate in (and in many cases formulate the terms of) debates from the 1960s onwards about Third World development' (TB 2004:341). This digression may help us understand some aspects of his overdeveloped state thesis.

Alavi started his career in the Bank of India as a Research Officer in 1945 and by 1952 he was one of its five principal officers. Unlike most (if not

quite all) Marxist intellectuals, Alavi left a comfortable career and moved to Tanzania to take up farming. He later enrolled for a PhD at the London School of Economics and then pursued a more conventional academic career at the Universities of Sussex, Leeds and Manchester. He was editor of *Pakistan Today* and was on the editorial boards of the *Journal of Contemporary Asia* and the *Journal of Peasant Studies*. Alavi was involved with various activist groups, such as the Pakistan Youth League, the Pakistan Socialist Society and the Committee for the Restoration of Democracy (formed after the 1958 coup), but not in formal electoral-based party politics.

Alavi's extended oeuvre over five decades included seminal pieces on US imperialism, aid to Pakistan, peasants, agrarian transition, kinship, women, ethnicity, the colonial mode of production, the sociology of developing societies, Islam and even on the Khilafat Movement. He was renowned for his original and controversial insights which went against the conceived wisdoms of, for example, Marxism and nationalism. He was a philosopher of Marxism but argued it was the middle peasantry (not the impoverished rural class) which was the most likely militant rural class and hence, a natural ally of the urban proletariat. Alavi's scholarship was very much in tune with and influenced the radical thinking of the 1960s and 1970s, in particular, his focus on imperialism and the colonial legacy. He argued that indigenous propertied classes were accommodated to imperialism and that capitalist development occurred on the basis of landowners utilising pre-capitalist production relations. This implied that the dominant structure was imperialism and global relations, and that domestic economic change was not contingent on eliminating feudal structures (TB 2004:342). Alavi departed from conventional nationalist Pakistani narratives, and downplayed the importance of religion behind the partition of British India; he argued instead that Muslim civil servants had led the movement to protect their jobs after independence – hence his arguments around the 'salariat' (Alavi 2002).

This diverse body of writing spanning a long academic career continued to find relevance for Pakistani scholars and a global academic audience. What is surprising though is that given (or perhaps because of) these very diverse scholarly interests, Alavi failed to formulate his 'grand theory of everything' related to the state and classes in Pakistan. He was unable (or unwilling), despite his understanding of Marxist and structuralist theories, to tie in his varied analysis into a single strand. While one could argue that Alavi may have been something of a 'polymath', what does seem surprising is that having written on so many varied themes, he never went back to try and build a more

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Excerpt
[More Information](#)

encapsulating theory of the Pakistani state and society to unite his wide oeuvre. Very few of his scholarly interventions engage with his other pieces; they often stand alone, making important points in different, unrelated disciplines. This absence of a broader formulation linking through his numerous essays on diverse themes is most evident in his essays on the Pakistani state.

Despite his own intellectual eclecticism, it is for one particular idea that Alavi is best remembered and regarded as widely influential. It would be no exaggeration to argue that much of the conceptualisation and theorisation around Pakistan's political economy, broadly defined, over the past forty years, has been around Pakistan's state, its military, and consequently, about imperialism. Our focus in this book is Alavi's 1972 paper published in the *New Left Review*, 'The State in Post-Colonial Societies: Pakistan and Bangladesh'. Alavi's (1972) thesis on the overdeveloped state has been revised and revisited in many forms by Alavi himself (see Alavi 1983, 1990, for example). The 1972 paper set the stage and provided the context for much subsequent analysis on political economy concerns in Pakistan. One obituary noted, 'rarely would one find a scholarly paper or a reading list in a relevant Sociology course at the best universities in the world where his article is not cited' (Sayeed 2004). Suhail (this volume) notes that the paper has been cited more than 1,100 times by scholars since publication.

For some scholars this enduring influence is proof of pioneering academic excellence. In 1972 the paper represented 'path-breaking work on the nature of the state in post-colonial societies' and was 'widely recognised as a major advance over the earlier theorisation about the nature of the state in Asia, Africa and Latin America by modernisation/political development and underdevelopment/dependency/world systems theorists' (Kumar 2004:3654). Alavi (1972) was a timely academic response to a crisis in theory and real politics. It was written in the context of the 1970s when a profound crisis in state theory prevailed during the advent of the debate framed around neo-liberalism and late capitalism. In the specific context of Pakistan, the creation of Bangladesh had 'shattered the idea of Islam as the ideological mask on which impossible territorial unity of Pakistan predicated its subjection to political dominance of the political classes' and Bhutto had risen to power and was still, in 1972, widely perceived to be a radical change to 'patrician and praetorian classes' as Suhail argues in this volume.

Despite his emphasis on the colonial and on imperialism, Alavi (1972) was not just a product of the dependency school which was so influential in the 1970s. Instead, he had provided a renewed opportunity to examine the

relationship between class and state in developing countries and the 'subsequent emergence of state centric political theory was epitomised in the writings of Alavi' (Kumar 2004:3654). Alavi challenged the traditional Marxist view by arguing in his overdeveloped state scheme that the superstructure could become dominant and the bureaucratic-military state could become autonomous of domestic and international class forces. According to Kumar (2004:3654), this reformulation of the state had a profound influence on the ideas and opinions of the then influential neo-Marxism of John Saul, Colin Leys, Mahmood Mamdani, Issa Shivji, Claude Millassoux and Michael Stepan regarding their views of the postcolonial state in Tanzania, Kenya, Uganda, Mali and Peru. And into the 1970s and 1980s, its influence manifested itself in the works of Pranab Bardhan, Gail Omvedt, Ashok Rudra, Supdipta Kaviraj, Achin Vanaik, among others, on theorising about the postcolonial state in India. Certainly Alavi does seem to have inspired the long-standing academic parlour game among scholars of Pakistan of trying to characterise the Pakistani state. Along with the overdeveloped state, in recent years we have also heard of the Garrison State, the Failed State, the World's Most Frightening State, the Drowning State and the Warrior State, among others.

This book starts with a less sanguine argument. The fact that a critic and interlocutor of Alavi's thesis writes that 'Alavi's conceptualisation appears to be remarkably resilient almost 40 years since it was formulated, and, at the very least, no other theory of the Pakistani state has emerged to compete meaningfully with the "overdeveloped" formulation' (Akhtar 2008:7), says more about the (dismal) state of social science and social scientists in Pakistan than about Alavi's original thesis (Zaidi 2002). Despite this starting point, the thinking of our contributors ranged freely and can be divided (by very rough characterisations) into those that focus on the enduring value of the 1972 paper and argue that it is still relevant (Shah, Javid and Armytage) and those who argue that it needs to be replaced by new thinking (Jan, Suhail, Javed, Akhtar and Khan).

THEORISING THE ALAVIAN PAKISTANI STATE¹

Here we very briefly summarise Hamza Alavi's key arguments about the nature of the state in Pakistan in 1972 through the most recent and thorough interpreter of Alavi's overdeveloped state thesis. Akhtar (2008) critiques Alavi's

¹ Much of this and the next Section draw from Akhtar (2008) and Zaidi (2014a).

formulation and builds on it, highlighting significant weaknesses and adapts it to the present socio-economic and political formation of Pakistan. Akhtar is particularly important because he builds on Alavi and gives us a unique critical continuity from 1972 to 2008, and to 2014, finally concluding with this book in 2019. Without Akhtar (2008), there would not have been a Zaidi (2014a) (this paper is discussed later in this introduction).

Hamza Alavi's 1972 argument was based on the notion that a nexus of power existed in Pakistan between the landlords, the military, the bureaucracy and what he called 'metropolitan capital' which, based on Pakistan's colonial legacy and evolution, resulted in an 'overdeveloped' postcolonial state dominating an un- or under-developed society. It was the military-bureaucratic 'oligarchy' with the three propertied classes which kept what can be called Pakistan's political settlement in place. One of Akhtar's (2008) many critiques is to dismiss Alavi's 'static conception of structure that underlies his understanding of the overdeveloped state'. More than three decades later, using a Gramscian framework, Akhtar (2018) also brings in the political and cultural spheres of analysis which were missing in much of the neo-Marxist analysis of the 1970s.

Inspired by Alavi's emphasis on class and building on (improving) his relatively weak empirical base, this volume is predictably quite concerned with the measurement of and exposition of class. Jan does utilise the standard definition of 'large farmer', as does Alavi, of 100+ acres, and acknowledges the difficulties of incorporating the distinction between land ownership and self-cultivation. Jan acknowledges that the share of area farmed by large landlords has declined, but his chapter goes beyond Alavi and argues that large farmers in Pakistan have reproduced their class power beyond the village by investing in trade, urban property and industry, and in children's education in order to help them take up professional occupations. This was one example of several in which Jan shows how class in contemporary Pakistan has become more complicated. Class, he argues, varies by area and over time, and is not an abstract category to be read off from a given mode of production. In Punjab and Sindh, families control important Sufi shrines where substantial landlords combine material power with religious authority. Social origins, especially the caste background of rural elites, are important, so class is not simply a material concept.

Javed writes about the rise of bazaar traders and the trend of their increasing participation in provincial and national politics, as evidenced by the share of seats they hold in the national assembly. These traders are able to influence policy through a variety of lobbying strategies such as rent-seeking ties

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Excerpt
[More Information](#)

with local state functionaries to evade taxes. Despite being an insulated and authoritarian regime, the efforts of the General Pervez Musharraf government (1999–2008) to assess the actual turnover of the retail sector through a documentation drive failed in the face of bazaar strikes including one that lasted eleven days in Punjab. In this volume, Armytage engages with Durr-e-Nayab's (2011) detailed taxonomy of class. In this schematic, 65 to 80 per cent of Pakistanis earn a living through manual labour, while the middle class (18 to 34 per cent of the population) are those with at least one family member with a tertiary education and one family member employed in non-manual work in sales, clerical, or professional positions. The upper middle class (6 per cent) are those with college education from one of the country's top schools, have probably been educated abroad, and are most likely to be employed as professionals, legislators, senior officials, managers, or in military roles. The upper elite (1 per cent) are in similar employment categories but in much more prominent roles and tend to derive income from profits on real estate and share ownership. Whether more neatly categorised such as by Armytage or loosely defined as by Jan, the definition and measurement of class is interrogated with rigour in many chapters of this book.

The rather vague assertions about measuring and evaluating state capacity in Alavi are fully reassessed and updated in this volume. This effort forms one of our key contributions to the discussion on the political economy of the state in Pakistan. The original inspiration for this book, Zaidi (2014a), wrote of a contemporary state in Pakistan that is unable to exercise its monopoly of violence uniformly across territories, while newly emerging groups such as the Taliban and urban mafias can both commit violence and challenge the brute force of the state. The state is unable to collect much tax revenue and many of its core functions in security and social services have been de facto privatised. But Shah (this volume) argues that the state's despotic power is still strong with its well-equipped military, para-military, intelligence and police, as demonstrated by its ability to wage external and internal wars. After 2014, for example, the state intervened successfully to displace the Pakistani Taliban from North Waziristan. In terms of state provision he notes that the story is not all about state failure, there are islands of state effectiveness such as the motorway police, construction of schools and employment of teachers. Shah notes that bureaucrats in the state have shown that they do have independent policy-making capabilities and that their agenda-setting power comes from different sources such as asymmetries in information, resources and expertise which together allow bureaucrats to shape the incentives of other social and

political groups. Javid and Suhail both argue that state power is contested at the local level by an array of historically constituted actors. But private patronage of this sort is ultimately dependent on connections to the state – it is access to public office or to those individuals who hold it that determines the capacity of traditional politicians and local level elites to provide patronage on a relatively large scale and to engage in rent seeking. Javid argues that the local state plays a crucial role in the delivery of patronage. The decentralisation on account of the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan in 2010 resulted in the devolution of more powers of patronage to lower levels of government departments such as health and education and provided provincial governments with greater mechanisms through which to exert control over the civil administration. Akhtar argues that the bureaucracy has changed and become more embedded in local networks so is more likely to use its position of authority to benefit linked patronage networks. The increasingly diverse composition of the bureaucracy, he also argues, does not really mean that the Westernised elite has been replaced by another social group but that the entire civilian side of the bureaucracy has fragmented. Khan (this volume) focuses on an argument missing in Alavi – in his overdeveloped state, a power asymmetry exists between state institutions and social classes but this cannot explain why this power asymmetry between state and social classes varies significantly from one place to another within Pakistan.

As Akhtar reminds us, not only was an analysis and evaluation of society completely missing in most of Alavi's work, but it also lacked any analysis or evaluation of resistance, in particular, and the working classes, in general. As Akhtar argues:

[W]hile Alavi's model of this state has offered much insight into the legacy of colonialism and the state forms it left behind, arguably the most gaping hole in his theoretical treatise is the lack of attention paid to the politics of the subordinate classes, or in other words, the working people upon whose exploitation the entire system of power rests. (Akhtar 2008:193)

There seems to be a complete absence of the dynamics of change and transition in Alavi's work, and one wonders how a theory of superstructure could have been so easily formulated ignoring social and class dynamics.

Although Akhtar (2008) makes the claim that 'Alavi's conceptualisation appears to be remarkably resilient' almost half a century later, Zaidi (2014a) rejects all claims to any relevance or resilience today. However, both Akhtar (2008) and Zaidi (2014a) recognise that much has changed in Pakistan, 'not

only with regard to how theorisation takes place, but also in terms of social structures and classes in Pakistan' (Zaidi 2014a:48). Akhtar brings in both notions of the 'intermediate class' – loosely called the middle class by others – and also religio-political movements and as players in the political arena in Pakistan. One of Akhtar's best known contributions has been that of the politics of 'common sense' or the ways in which people accept how power is actually articulated in Pakistan, hindering the possibility of popular politics and resistance and leading to 'the existing configuration of power' being 'reproduced as a function of both dominance and consent' (Akhtar 2008:32). Akhtar adds much value to an analysis 'from below' (Akhtar 2017, 2018).

This volume provides a major intervention in the debates around the nature of the political economy of Pakistan, focusing on the social dynamics of contemporary Pakistan, a theme which forms the core of all the contributions. Jan writes about the declining power of the old aristocracy and rising prominence of the rural middle class. Shah writes about the importance of social processes such as urbanisation, the middle class and the informal sector. Javed deals with capitalism and urbanisation, the decline of the old landed class and the rise of bazaar traders linked to rise of informal economy. Javid explores the rise of brokers who connect the state, politicians and those seeking patronage. Akhtar talks of an intermediate stratum which has historically emerged through the development of secondary and tertiary sectors of the agrarian economy which is now the face of capitalist modernity in Pakistan and also of the rise of the service sector and urbanisation. He looks beyond Pakistan to note that imperialism has changed in ways not accounted for by Alavi, which includes new internet and communications technology, financialisation and the rise of China and its role in infrastructure investment in Pakistan. He asks whether the rise of China represents a countervailing tendency to the historic influence of Western imperialism or will this just strengthen the traditional coercive arm of the state without enhancing the policy autonomy of the state.

Afiya S. Zia notes the importance of changes in the economy, mobility and social attitudes which follow a rapid increase in women's participation in the workforce, in the pursuit of education and in paid activism and the development sector, with religion playing a critical role as well. Khan discusses how changes in socio-economic processes led to new patterns of spatiality in villages and towns. Districts in central and northern Punjab, he notes, have relatively better provisioning of public goods such as roads, electricity and schools. McCartney records the dramatic shift in agricultural policy that provided farmers little direct support in the 1950s and massive support through

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Excerpt
[More Information](#)

subsidies, support prices, rural infrastructure especially irrigation, and loans from state banks in the 1960s. The rising middle classes feature prominently in this volume, where Jan writes that governments from Ayub Khan onwards tried to break the power of the landed aristocracy by patronising the rural middle classes. More recently, this has complicated the definition of class as the investment in children's education by large landlords has allowed them to become professionals such as doctors, lawyers and engineers. Javid argues that the reforms of the civil service under Bhutto opened up the civil service to the middle class, while Akhtar writes that current estimates of the middle class have reached 60 million, though the aspiration to be middle class is even more important and the social goal has become a 'major cog in the hegemonic order'.

It is clear that many have criticised Alavi's view of the state, arguing that his influence has led scholars into a static treatment of the state and its relations with society and that they have been constrained by the overdeveloped presence of Alavi, limiting original thinking (Zaidi 2014a). This is not just about the weakness or inertia of Pakistani academia but is in part intrinsic to Alavi's original model. The overdeveloped state, argues Saul (1974), has its three core functions – to create territorial unity, promote economic development and subordinate social classes. This type of functionalism, according to Sang-Mpam (1986:611), 'explains the static and rigid notion of the inherited state; which is found in most writings on the postcolonial state' which is 'reified and tailored once and for all'. Many of the contributors to this volume move beyond this view and argue that the state in Pakistan never did do what Alavi claimed an overdeveloped state would and should be doing. Suhail (this volume) notes that Alavi frames his analysis in terms of a materialist interpretation of the state whereby the bureaucratic-military state appropriates the lion's share of the surplus from all sectors of production, while holding the productive forces in underdeveloped stasis relative to metropolitan capital. McCartney (this volume) finds that the empirical evidence for Pakistan shows that the state has instead failed to mobilise tax revenue and save and, except for agriculture in the 1960s, it has generally been unable to consistently implement policies, plans and long-term goals. This book engages with how the state has changed over time. Zia (this volume) argues that the state and societal institutions are increasingly loaded with an Islamic bias and justice is dispensed within this framework. Even judges have been compromised by Islamists, and militant groups have taken over the practice of justice. Khan introduces the logic of state spatiality and argues that the postcolonial state of Pakistan can be best characterised by uneven development of state space.

Akhtar (2008) had argued that 'the structure of power' has changed and is continuously evolving. The dialectic and the articulation between state, society, social classes, resistance and the like was missing in Alavi's analysis. Another important correction by Akhtar (2008) is the critique of Alavi's notion that from among the three 'propertied classes' he considered the metropolitan bourgeoisie to be the most powerful. Following David Harvey (2003), Akhtar made the distinction between the capitalist logic of imperialism and its territorial logic, arguing that the nature of relationships between imperialism and Pakistan need not be of the capitalist extractive kind, but one which fits in to a broader world view of the territorial logic of imperialism, a fact which seems well articulated after 1979. Akhtar is correct in stating that 'Alavi tends to analytically conflate the role of metropolitan *capital*, with the political impulse of metropolitan *states*, implying that the operational dynamics of these two qualitatively different manifestations of metropolitan power in the Pakistani social formation are indistinguishable' (Akhtar 2008:115).²

While there is much to build on in Akhtar's (2008) departure from Alavi, there is also some difference in emphasis and understanding. We (in this introduction) do not agree with Akhtar when he states, 'Alavi's basic contention that the postcolonial state is little more than a coercive apparatus and that this apparatus is directly inherited from the colonial state is compelling because the 'military-bureaucratic oligarchy' that was essentially a British creation *is still the country's dominant political force*' (Akhtar 2008: 8, emphasis added) and even when he further states, 'Few scholars of Pakistan would disagree that the coercive role of the state and its ability to maintain a consensus with the dominant classes would appear to be the two defining features of Pakistan's political economy well into the 21st century' (Akhtar 2008:8). We argue that it is perhaps not possible to see the state as such, given its fracturisation and inability to function even at a 'normal' level (Zaidi 2014a). However, Zaidi (2014a) and Akhtar (2008) are in agreement about the rise of new social classes, of the informal sector, of the increasing dominance of the urban economy with its manifestations, and about the fracturisation of power and hegemony of the state. Some critical differences in emphasis do, however, exist (see Zaidi 2014a for further discussion).

Numerous other contentions and departures in this collection from Alavi's interpretation of Pakistan's social formation and of its supposedly

² Akhtar adds in a footnote that '[i]n his empirical analysis however, Alavi's focus is on the manner in which the geo-strategic interests of imperialist *states*, and particularly the US, have been a major cause of the militarisation of the Pakistani state'.

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
 Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
 Index
[More Information](#)

Index

- Abbassi, Zaheerul Islam, 88
 Abbottabad operation, 248–249
 Abrams, P., 117–118, 125
 Abu-Lughod, Lila, 96
 academic-activists, diasporic, 99
 activism, 8, 96, 106
 Adamjee, 32
 Adeney, Katherine, 226
 agency, 78, 80, 82, 88, 94–95, 99, 104–105, 107, 159; women's religious, 96; of women's resistance, 94
 agrarian: change, 177–178, 182–187, 190–191, 194–195; economy, 8, 30, 57, 63; transformation, 177, 188–194; transition, 1–2, 183
 Agricultural Development Bank of Pakistan (ADBP), 28, 37, 188
 Agricultural Development Finance Corporation (ADFC), 27
 agricultural: census, 178; policy, 8, 27, 29; tribes, 186–187
 agriculturalists, 180, 209
 agriculture, 9, 26–30, 35–37, 177, 179–181, 192–194
 agro-commercial trade, 180, 190
 agro-industry, 63, 180, 193
abl-e-kitab, 70
 Ahmad, Aijaz, 15
 Ahmad, Ali Nobil, 248
 Ahmad, Eqbal, 15
 Ahmad, Saghir, 15
 Ahmed, Feroz, 15
 Ahmed, K., 248
 Ahmed, Mumtaz, 205
 Akhtar, Aasim Sajjad, 4–5, 7–12, 17, 19–22, 35, 43, 75, 78, 83, 110, 119–120, 126, 130, 135–137, 142, 148–149, 160–162, 171, 188, 191–192, 199–200, 212, 216, 218, 220, 223
 Akhter, Majed, 19
 Alam, Absar, 249
 Alavi, Hamza, 1–15, 18, 20–21, 25–30, 32–35, 38–50, 56–57, 61–62, 65–67, 69, 72, 75, 77–79, 93–96, 98, 110–115, 119–120, 130, 135–136, 149, 154, 158–160, 176–180, 184, 199–200, 220, 236, 241, 243–244, 251–253; analysis of society of, 57; thesis of, 4, 75, 131, 176, 218, 241, 244, 247, 252–253; career of, 1; model of, 7, 13, 25–26, 35, 48–50, 110, 113; works of, 7, 11, 57, 66–67, 70, 110, 113, 130, 136, 218
 Alavian: formulation, 13, 17, 57, 70, 115, 199; framework, 72, 114, 146; Pakistani state, 4–13
 Ali, Fahd, 19
 Ali, T., 33
 Alienation of Land of 1901, 233
 All India Trade Union Congress (AITUC), 46
 All Pakistan Anjuman-i-Tajiran (All Pakistan Association of Traders, APAT), 206–208
 All Pakistan Confederation of Labour (APCOL), 46
 alliances, 154, 162, 168, 170, 172, 177, 181, 188, 190, 207, 232

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi

Index

[More Information](#)

262

Index

- Al-Qaeda, 80, 88
 Althusser, L., 242
 American Civil War, 139
 Amjad, Rashid 15, 222
 Anglo-US academia, 106
 Anjuman-i-Tajran, 210, 212
 Anthropology, 16, 18, 20, 96
 anti-Ayub movement, 220
 anti-Bhutto: movement, 204–207;
 sentiment, 208
 anti-colonial: movement, 45; struggle, 63
 anti-corruption court, 86
 anti-democratic behaviour, 87
 anti-establishment bloggers, 86
 anti-Musharraf movement, 61
 anti-regime protests, 84
 anti-Shia jihadist groups, 102
 Arains, 187, 190
 Arif, M., 251
 Army Welfare Trust (AWT), 147–148
 Armytage, Rosita, 4, 6, 12, 21, 153, 168
 ARY network, 252
 Asad, Talal, 96
 Asian Development Bank, 17
 authoritarianism, 60, 235, 242
 autonomy, 8, 11, 26–27, 33–34, 36–37, 39,
 43–44, 46, 48, 66–67, 76–78, 84, 90,
 96, 103–104, 113, 192, 203, 212,
 218; institutional, 82
 Awami League, 35
 Aziz, S., 102, 220
 Baig, Noaman, 203
 Balochistan/Baluchistan/Baloch, 35, 38,
 41, 67, 71, 79, 84–86, 88, 98, 102,
 124, 137, 139–140, 147, 167–168,
 232, 249, 251–252; marginalisation
 of 140; natural gas from 147
 banal statism, 78–81
 Bangladesh, 3, 111, 114, 165, 167
 Bank, 14–15, 17, 22, 37, 188, 202, 210
 Bano, Masooda, 104
 Baran, Paul, 182
 Bardhan, Pranab K., 4, 44
 bargaining power, 136, 145, 179
 basic democrats (BD), 189
 Batatu, 182
 Baxter, Craig, 223
 bazaar, 5–6, 8, 12, 20–21, 200–212;
 elites, Mumtaz Ahmed on, 205;
 and mosque relationship, 211; led
 shutter-down strikes, 206; traders, 5,
 8, 12, 200–201, 203–212
 Beg, Aslam, 85
 Benazir Income Support Programme
 (BISP), 107, 221
 Bengali nationalism, 11, 83. *See also* East
 Pakistan; Bangladesh
 Bhatti, Haji Ashraf, 206
 Bhutto, Z.A., 3, 9, 12, 69, 83, 97, 114,
 161, 165–166, 179, 204–205,
 207, 220, 223, 246; arrest of,
 207; demonstration against, 206;
 execution of, 207; populist ideology
 and, 165; regime of, 32, 48, 58, 63,
 183, 204, 208
 bin Laden, Osama, killing of, 88, 248–249
biraderis, 155, 187, 189–191
 blasphemy cases, 100–101, 161, 211
 Bol TV, 251
 bourgeoisie, 19, 30, 83, 98, 112, 183;
 indigenous, 25–26, 30–32, 43, 48,
 113, 154, 158, 163; industrial, 32, 44,
 48, 83; metropolitan, 10, 25–26, 43,
 57, 65–66, 112–113, 153, 220, 236;
 metropolitan neo-colonial, 158, 163;
 monopoly, 183; neo-colonial, 78,
 154; Punjabi industrial, 83
 Brenner, N., 133
 British, 2, 10, 30, 38, 40–42, 44, 58–61,
 63–64, 68–69, 77, 139–140, 164,
 186–187, 228, 233; civil servants, 44;
 Indian Civil Service (ICS) in, 37;
 property rights regime in, 68
 British Indian army, 41, 61; Muslims in, 40
 brokers, 8, 46, 221–222, 225–226, 231,
 233–235

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi

Index

[More Information](#)

Index

263

- Bruton, H.J., 14
- bureaucracy, 5, 7, 11, 25, 30, 34–35, 37–40, 42–44, 46, 49, 57–59, 67, 69, 112–114, 118, 154, 158, 162, 164–167, 169, 171, 176, 189, 193, 218, 221–223, 225, 227–130, 233, 236; as Punjabi-dominated, 167
- bureaucratic-military state oligarchy, 4, 40, 43–44, 77, 112, 158–160, 163
- Burki, Shahid J., 15, 183
- business, 16, 21, 32, 104, 121, 148, 156, 158–159, 162–172, 180, 183, 205, 210, 222, 243; communities of Gujarati as, 158; elite, 157, 165–166, 171, 222; of journalism, 252; private, 32, 166
- Butt, Haji Maqsood Ahmed, 206, 208
- campaigns, 88, 226, 230
- capital, 62–65; accumulation, 144, 146, 200, 222; and labour relation, 64
- capitalism, 3, 8, 18, 21, 56, 64, 67, 76, 78, 99, 106, 111, 113, 115, 131, 136, 148, 177, 199–200, 202, 212, 218–219, 236; peripheral, 113, 115
- capitalist, 10, 26, 82, 115, 125, 132, 148, 165, 180, 182, 218, 225; development, 2, 43, 76, 135; farming, 29; modernity, 8, 57, 65
- caste/castes, 40, 68–69, 147, 186–187; dominant peasant, 190; Makhdoom Syed, 190
- CENTO treaty, 40
- Central Board of Revenue (CBR), 38, 148
- Chandra, Kanchan, 217
- Chaudhry, A., 221
- Chaudhry, Iftikhar Muhammad, 84
- Cheema, Ali, 161, 201, 220–221, 223
- Cheema, M.H., 97
- Cheema, Umer, kidnap of, 250
- Chief Election Commissioner, 39
- Chief of Army Staff (COAS), 60–61, 148
- China, 8, 34; arms supplies from, 34; investments by, 67
- China–Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), 66–67
- Chinese influx, 66
- Chomsky, N., 243
- citizenship, 100, 105, 121
- Civil Administration Act of 2017, 229
- civil bureaucracy, 25, 34, 43, 82, 135
- Civil Services of Pakistan (CSP), 9, 11, 35, 37–40, 42, 49, 58, 60, 148, 167, 223
- civil society, 17, 60, 80, 89–90, 115, 117, 119–120, 124, 142–143, 211–212; protests, 86
- civil–military: bureaucracies, 135–136, 140–141, 199; dispute, 251; hegemony, 252; oligarchy, 43, 241, 251–252; politics, 83; power imbalance, 85, 143; relations, 76, 78, 83
- class, 4–9, 19–22, 25–30, 43, 56–58, 60–61, 65, 67–72, 75–76, 78–79, 81–83, 93–97, 99, 101–102, 104–106, 112–116, 119–120, 130–133, 146–149, 153–165, 168–172, 176–179, 182–185, 188–190, 200–201, 208–209, 217–221, 223–224, 231–233, 235–236; based movements, 160; capitalist, 183; complexity of, 182–187; composition, 161, 223; economic, 185; faith has replaced, 17; feudal landowning, 43, 68, 158, 163, 179, 188; formation, 131, 136, 179, 184, 200–201; intermediate, 8, 63–65, 70–71, 136, 160–161, 183, 200–201, 203; landlord, 177; merchant, 30; middle, 161; multi, 76, 132, 146, 160, 200; political, 3, 41, 227; process, 132; propertied, 2, 5, 10, 25–35, 42–44, 48–49, 57, 63, 69, 79, 113, 154, 160, 162, 199, 208, 220, 223, 225, 229, 233; ruling, 153–155, 158–163, 166–168, 217–220, 223–224, 236, 243; social, 7, 9–10, 19, 21, 76–78, 81–82, 112, 149, 158,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi

Index

[More Information](#)

264

Index

- 172, 178; structure, 22, 57, 153–155, 157, 218; subordinate, 7, 25, 58, 65, 69–71, 81–82, 188, 235; upper, 100, 105; upper-middle, 153, 167; white-collar, 65; working, 7, 46, 81–82, 99, 101, 114, 165, 252–253
- Clemens, 211
- clientelism, 179, 187, 191; service delivery, 191
- CNIC (state-issued national identity card) 121–124
- coalitions, 14, 35, 76–77, 136, 159–162, 200, 209, 220, 227. *See also* alliances
- coercive/despotic state, 17, 68, 71, 82, 84, 87–90, 136, 243; power, 6, 80
- collective action, 229–233
- colonial: administrators, 158; experiences, 141; grants, 187; historiography, 63; legacy, 2, 5, 78, 140, 220; masters, 60; period, 38, 42, 58–59, 69–70, 137, 140, 147, 188, 193, 233; power, 158, 169; rule/colonialism, 7, 42, 65, 78, 112, 130, 139–140, 158, 163, 199, 216, 220
- Committee for the Restoration of Democracy, 2
- communications technologies, 8, 66
- Communist Party, 47
- conflict, 43–44, 46, 49, 76, 99, 154–155, 159, 194, 219; distributive, 45
- conservatism, 93, 104
- contextual space, 134
- Constitution of Pakistan, 8th Amendment, 7, 218, 226–229, 231–233, 236; 18th Amendment, 7, 22, 218, 226, 228–229, 231–233, 236; Waseem on, 227
- contract farming, 193
- corporations, 39, 167
- corruption, 39, 42, 59, 86, 193
- counter-terrorist initiatives, 67. *See also* war against terrorism
- coup, 2; by Ayub Khan in 1958, 34–36, 39, 41; by Pervez Musharraf, 137; by Zia ul Haq in 1977, 41, 93, 137
- Court of Wards Act of 1872, 233
- Credit Inquiry Commission 1959, 32
- crisis, 3, 22, 35, 66, 111, 125, 139
- Dawn/Dawn News* 89, 244, 252
- Dawood, 32
- decentralisation, 7, 34
- decolonisation, 58, 141
- democracy, 12, 17, 20, 26, 48, 60, 78, 82–83, 89, 93, 106, 142, 209, 212–213, 216–217, 220, 225, 233, 235–236
- democratic interregnum, 246
- democratisation, 1, 11–12, 82, 94, 194, 199, 203, 230, 235–236
- Depalpur, 185, 190
- devaluation, 31, 164; of sterling, 164
- development, 9, 11, 13–14, 17, 57, 62, 76, 78, 83, 96–97, 100, 102–105, 111, 119, 137–139, 141–142, 171, 190, 212, 217, 225, 231, 236, 253; of agrarian economy 8; economic 9, 36, 62; funding, 224–225, 231; funding agencies, 106; gender in, 104; industrial, 137; infrastructure, 83; initiatives, 42, 46, 103, 225; institutional, 220, 235; international agencies of, 100; of military, 243; political, 78; postcolonial, 137; programmes, 189, 225; in Punjab, 139; resources for, 33; schemes, 225, 231; sector, 8, 96, 226, 235; socio-economic, 138; of state-spaces, 138; tube-well, 29
- Development Advisory Service, 33
- devolution of power, 7, 226–228, 236
- diaspora, 18
- Dogars, 190
- domestic policies, 33, 100
- donor driven Islam, 102
- Dunya TV, 249, 252

- Durrani, Asad, 85
 Durr-e-Nayab, 6, 156
 dynasties, 12, 12, 161, 169
 East Pakistan, 30, 33, 35, 46, 141, 165;
 language riots in, 46. *See also*
 Bangladesh
 economic growth, 22, 82, 155, 171, 182, 202
 economists, 13, 15, 115, 156–157
 economy, urban-land, 148
 Elahi, Haji Inam, 206
 Elahi, Sheikh Inam, 208
 electables, 232–233
 elections, 12, 35, 44–45, 63, 86–87, 89, 94,
 161, 188, 207–209, 212, 223–224,
 230–235; malpractice in, 205; in
 1946, 45; in 1962, 189; in 1965,
 189; in 1970, 41; in 1977, 205–206;
 in 1979, 207, 209; in 1983, 209; in
 2015, 211, 234; in 2018, 89
 Elective Bodies Disqualification
 Ordinance (EBDO), 41
 elite (*ashraf*), 5, 7, 12, 20–22, 82–83, 101,
 112, 154–155, 158–163, 168–172,
 176, 179, 186, 188, 204–205, 208,
 210–211, 216, 221–223, 225, 229;
 alliances, 158, 172; bureaucratic-
 military, 35; business, 157; and
 dominant institutions, 172;
 domination, 158, 236; landed, 11,
 83, 166, 176–177, 179, 181, 184,
 188, 192, 195; Navay Raje, 170;
 ruling class, 81, 158, 162, 165–166,
 229; rural, 5, 177, 184, 194;
 uppermost, 156; Urdu-speaking
 upper caste, 163
 employment, 6, 16, 64–65, 134, 144–145,
 156, 171, 202–203, 217
 enlightenment, moderate, 147
 entrepreneurs, 64, 203–204
 Established Elites, 169–171
 ethnic groups, 62; non-Punjabi as, 168
 ethnic nationalists, 71
 ethnicity, 1–2, 69, 81, 121, 141, 147, 168,
 232
 ethnography, 153, 158, 187
 everyday state, 71, 120
 exploitation, 7, 21, 57, 81
 Export Bonus System, 31
 exports, 26, 140, 145, 147, 180
 factionalism, 194, 220, 230, 234
 Faiz, Faiz Ahmed, 17, 244–245
 farmers, 5, 8, 25–30, 35–37, 44, 48–49,
 167, 177–180, 182, 184–188, 190,
 193–194; capitalist, 177, 180,
 182, 184–187, 190; commercial,
 181; large, 5, 25–30, 48, 178–179,
 181; larger mechanised, 28; self-
 cultivating, 186–187; small, 29, 167;
 tenant, 26
 farming, 2, 26, 178, 180–181, 185, 187,
 193–194; large, 26, 28–29, 177, 191.
 See also agrarian; agriculture
fatwa, 102
 Fazlullah, 105
 Federal Agricultural Bank (FAB), 27, 250
 Federal and Provincial Development
 Sector Programmes, 226
 Federal Investigation Agency (FIA), 85
 Federally Administered Tribal Areas
 (FATA), 80, 85; counter-insurgency
 operations in, 87
 feminism, 94, 103–104
 feminists, modernist, 103–104
 feudalism, 20, 29, 64, 153, 177, 182, 187,
 219
 financialisation, 8, 66
 Five-Year Plan: First, 33, 36; Second, 36
 Ford Foundation, 33
 foreign direct investment (FDI), 33, 145
 foreign exchange revenue, 64
 formal economy, 64, 120
 Foucault, Michel, 117, 125, 135
 fractions, 61, 113–114, 116, 119–120, 182,
 200, 220, 223, 236

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi

Index

[More Information](#)

266

Index

- Free Trade List, 33
 freedom of speech, 12
 gang war, 121–122, 124
 Gardezi, Hasan, 15, 20
 Garrison State, 4, 35, 60, 118, 126
 GDP (gross domestic product), 27, 30, 36, 42, 202
 General Sales Tax (GST), 210
 generals, 43, 69–70, 82, 85–86, 88–90, 118, 148, 154, 163. *See also under separate entries*
 Geo TV, 86, 88–89, 143, 249–251
 Geo–ISI dispute, 250
 Ghafoor, Asif, 87
 Gilgit–Baltistan, 67
 Gilmartin, David, 187
 Global South, 145
 global: capitalism, 66–67; financial crisis, 22
 globalisation, 21, 94, 145
 Gotsch, C.H., 184
 government spending, 36, 147
 Gramsci, Antonio, 56, 58, 71, 84, 119, 136, 242
 Gramscian: common sense approach of, 17; framework, 5, 56; style hegemonic strategy, 84
 grants, 164, 186–187, 193, 225–226; constituency, 225; development, 226
 Green Revolution, 28–29, 37, 43, 63–64, 69
 Griffin, Keith, 13
 Guha, Ranajit, 43, 69, 84, 119
 Gujjars, 187
 Gupta, A., 117, 124
 Haider, A.S., 184
 Hamid, Zaid, 250
 Harriss-White, B., 203
 Harvey, David, 10, 66, 134
 hegemony, 10, 18, 58, 65, 77, 81, 84, 135–136, 140–142, 188, 192, 195, 243
 Heintz, James, 143–145
 Herman, E., 242–243
 Herring, Ronald J., 13
 Higher Education Commission (HEC), 16
 high-yield variety (HYV) seeds, 28–29, 37. *See also* Green Revolution
 historiography, 63, 119
 history, 16, 18, 56, 62, 69–70, 76, 82, 90, 94, 111, 119, 121, 134, 167, 200, 219, 253
 homogenisation, 141–142
 human rights organisations, 100
 Huntington, Samuel, 45
 Husain, Ishrat, 157–158
 Hussain, Akmal, 184
 Ideological State Apparatuses (ISAs), 242–243
 IMF, 15
 imperialism, 2–3, 8, 10, 20, 56–57, 61, 65–67, 93–95, 105–106, 113
 incumbency, 231–232
 independent candidates, 87, 230, 234
 independent media, 242
 India, 2, 4, 13, 18, 21, 30–31, 33–34, 37–42, 44–49, 56, 68, 78, 84, 100, 139–140, 143, 163–164, 167, 181, 203, 233–235, 243; British in, 37; colonial, 56; combat readiness against, 85; Emergency in, 41
 India Act, 44
 Indian Civil Service (ICS), 37–38, 42
 Indian labour movement, 48
 indigenous bourgeoisie exercises, 66. *See also* bourgeoisie
 Indus Basin Replacement Workers, 37
 industrial concentration, 1
 Industrial Courts, 47–48
 Industrial Development Bank of Pakistan (IDBP), 31
 Industrial Disputes Act 1947, 47
 Industrial Disputes Ordinance 1959, 47
 Industrial Relations Ordinance (IRO) 1969, 48

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi

Index

[More Information](#)

Index

267

- industrial undertakings, 30
- industrialisation, 14, 46–47, 63, 82, 202; as state-instigated, 63
- industrialists, 32, 35, 44, 49, 69, 153, 157, 164, 166, 245
- industry, 5, 30–31, 35–37, 48, 106, 133, 158, 163–165, 179–180; fertiliser, 193
- inequality, 22, 28, 30, 72, 118, 154, 156–159, 165
- inflation, 48, 140, 145
- informal: economy, 8, 64, 124, 143–145, 179, 202–203; employment, 144–145; sector, 8, 10, 17, 75, 144–145
- informalisation, 64–65, 131, 143–144, 212
- information and communications technologies (ICT), 66
- infrastructural: development, 139–140; investment, 8; power, 80
- Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), 13–14, 33, 188
- Institutions, 7, 9, 13, 17–22, 41, 45, 58, 60–62, 75–76, 78, 80–83, 88–90, 93, 101–102, 110, 112–113, 115–116, 118–120, 131, 135, 137, 141–143, 146–149, 154, 160–161, 168–172, 176, 217–219, 223–225, 229; civilian, 17, 137, 142–143, 217; decision-making, 168; multi-class, 146
- insurgency, 252
- intellectuals, organic, 142. *See also* intelligentsia, liberal
- intelligence, 6, 80; agencies, 162
- intelligentsia, liberal, 97, 101
- Inter Service Public Relations (ISPR), 11, 87, 143, 249–250
- inter-capitalist competition, 147
- intermediate: class, 8, 57, 63–65, 70–71, 136, 160–161, 183, 200–201, 203; regime, 200
- Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI), 85–88, 249–251
- intra-class differences, 81, 183–184
- investment, 9, 27, 36, 147, 179
- Iqtidar, Humeira, 97–98, 100, 104
- ISIS, 101
- Islam, 2–3, 15, 20–21, 58, 63, 70–71, 88, 93–97, 102–107, 114, 118, 125, 187, 223, 232, 236, 246
- Islamabad, 14, 17, 137, 167, 251
- Islamic: fundamentalism, 94; punishment, 101
- Islamisation, 69–70, 93–95, 107
- Islamists, 9, 96–103, 106
- Islamophobia, 95, 98
- Jaffrelot, Christophe 167, 248
- jagirdars*, 187
- Jalal, Ayesha, 77, 165
- Jamaat ud Dawa (JuD), 100
- Jamaat-i-Islami (JI), 94, 206
- Jamiat-Ulema-Pakistan (JUP), 206
- Jan, Muhammad Ali, 4–6, 8–9, 11, 18, 22
- Jang Group, 143, 250, 252
- Jatts, 186–187, 189–190. *See also* caste/ castes
- Javed, Umair, 4, 8, 12, 19, 83, 211
- Javid, Hassan, 4, 7–9, 11–12, 21–22, 59, 62, 180, 188, 192, 223
- Jessop, B., 219
- jihad*, 70, 80, 97, 100, 102, 247–248
- Jilani, Asma, 85
- Jinnah, Muhammad Ali, 46, 163–164, 244
- Jones, P.E., 179, 188
- judiciary, 19, 42, 60, 84, 90, 141–142, 146, 148, 160, 176, 199, 248
- Junejo, Mohammad Khan, 83
- Kalecki, Michal, 200
- Karachi, 14, 19, 22, 46, 79, 88, 101–102, 106, 111, 121, 124–125, 137, 164–168, 203, 216, 245, 251–252
- Karachi Stock Exchange (KSE), 32, 167
- Kaviraj, Supdipta, 4
- Kayani, 249
- Kemal, A.R., 14

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
 Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
 Index
[More Information](#)

268

Index

- Khan, A. Mahmood, 170
 Khan, A.R., 13
 Khan, Asghar, 85
 Khan, Ayub, 9, 12, 34–35, 39–40, 44, 47, 85, 94, 165, 183, 188–189, 204, 245–246; Planning Commission of, 165; regime of, 189
 Khan, Danish, 7–9
 Khan, Imran, 87, 170
 Khan, Mahmood Hasan, 7–9, 15
 Khan, Mushtaq, 222
 Khan, Yahya, 48, 60, 85
 Khawaja, Asim I., 222, 226
 Khilafat Movement, 2
 Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK), 21–22, 79, 103–104, 232
 Kochanek, S., 222
 Kristof, Nicholas, 106
 KTN Channel, 252
 Kuhnen, P., 184
 Kumar, Mitra, 4
 labour, 6, 22, 26, 28–29, 37, 46–49, 64, 82, 133, 144–147, 155, 166, 178, 190, 200–202, 207–208, 212; hiring of wage, 185; productivity, 145
 labourers, 81; peasantry/landless, 192. *See also* farmers
 Laclau, Ernesto, 56
 Lady Health Workers, 105, 107
 Lahore Chamber of Commerce and Industry (LCCI), 207
 Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS), 16
 Lakson Group, 252
 landed aristocracy, traditional, 27
 land-grabbed communities, 101
 landholdings: large, 179, 191; middle, 189
 landlords, 5, 9, 11, 27, 69, 83, 153, 157, 166, 177–179, 182, 184–192, 194, 209, 216, 221, 225, 233; absentee, 184, 186, 190; aristocratic, 186; large, 5, 9, 11, 26, 179, 184–185, 187, 190; self-cultivation by, 26
 landowners, 2, 26, 29–30, 35, 44, 155, 167–168, 177–178, 180–181, 183–191, 194; Gotsch on, 184; middle, 188–189; smaller, 177, 183–184, 194
 LaPorte Jr, R., 220
 Lashkar e Tayabba. *See* Jamaat ud Dawa (JuD)
 Lawyers' Movement, 11, 17, 61, 84–85, 161–162
 Lefebvre, Henri, 130, 133, 135–136, 141–142
 legislation, 22, 48, 103, 210, 216, 226–227, 233
 Lewis, S.R., 31
 Leys, Colin, 4
 liberalisation, 96, 115, 244, 247, 250, 252; economic, 210
 liberal-secularists, 98
 local government, 22, 207, 209, 211, 223–224, 226–228, 233–234
 Local Government Acts, 227, 233
 Local Government Commissions (LGCs), 22, 227, 231
 Lyari, 19, 22, 111, 121–124
 Mahmood, Saba, 105
 Mahoney, J., 219
 Majlis Shura, 42
 Makhdooms, 190
 Makki *masjid*, 206
 Malala, assassination attempt on. *See* Yousafzai, Malala
 Mamdani, Mahmood, 4
 Mann, Michael, 80–81
 Manto, Saadat Hasan, 245
 manufacturers, small-scale, 183, 210
 manufacturing, 30, 32, 137, 164, 166, 202, 204, 209
 martial law, 43, 85, 246
 Martial Law Regulation (MLR), 207
 Martin, Nicholas, 189
 Marxism, 1–2, 4–5, 21, 56, 71, 78, 111–112, 115, 117, 119, 125–126, 130–131, 146, 149, 153–154, 158, 182, 200, 219; structural 56–57

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi

Index

[More Information](#)

Index

269

- Masud, M. Khalid, 104
- Mazdoor Kissan Raj, 69
- media, 87, 96, 241, 243–244, 247–253; boom 252; electronic, 87–89, 250; enterprises as private, 17, 142–143, 176; houses 252 (*see also under separate entries*); monopoly of, 252–253; political economy of, 242–243, 248, 250, 253
- Members of the National Assembly (MNAs), 11, 166, 209, 225
- Members of the Provincial Assemblies (MPAs), 12, 225
- Memogate scandal, 61
- merchants, 63, 183, 200, 203
- metropolitan, 5, 9–10, 18, 26, 32–35, 43, 49, 57, 65–66, 110, 112–113, 137, 153, 158, 163, 220, 236, 241, 252; capital, 5, 9–10, 18, 26, 32–35, 49, 113, 241, 252
- Mian, A., 222
- middle class, 6, 8–9, 16, 19–21, 27, 60, 65, 71–72, 75, 81, 94, 99, 107, 153, 155, 158, 160–161, 171, 177, 179, 182–185, 188–190, 192, 194, 200, 218, 220, 223, 233, 236; agricultural entrepreneurs, 27; elites, 45; formation, 200; lower, 94, 101; rural, 8–9, 177, 183, 188–190, 192, 194; upper, 6, 156, 161; Urdu–Punjabi, 242; voters, 235
- migrant Gujarati-speaking businessmen, 30
- migrants, 31, 39, 64, 211
- migrations, Gulf, 64, 69
- Milibus, 43, 62, 243
- militants/militant groups, 9, 22, 67, 71, 79, 87, 99, 101–103
- military, 3–6, 9–11, 16–22, 25, 35–36, 38–44, 46–47, 49, 60–62, 66–67, 75–78, 80, 82–90, 93–94, 112–114, 135, 137, 140–143, 146–148, 154–167, 169–171, 209–211, 216–218, 220, 225–226, 233, 235–236, 243, 245, 247–253; alliance of US, 33; authoritarian, 89; campaign of intimidation by, 86; coup, 36, 39, 41, 93; dominance, 78, 82–83; and Film Censor Board, 249; government, 11, 16, 41–42, 44, 47, 164, 211, 225–226
- military–bureaucratic oligarchy, 5, 10, 40, 57, 62, 66, 69, 176, 194
- Millassoux, Claude, 4
- Mills, Wright, 154
- Minimum Wage Boards, 47
- Mir, Hamid, 11, 88, 143, 250; attack on, 250
- Misbah-ur-Rehman, 207
- Mitchell, Timothy, 118
- modernists, 94, 103. *See also under* feminists
- Mohmand, Shandana K., 191, 221
- Mossadeq's nationalisation, 33
- Mouffe, Chantal, 56
- Movement for the Restoration of Democracy (MRD), 11, 17, 83, 142
- Mughals, 168, 186
- Muhajirs, 39, 163–164, 167–168; Gujarati-speaking traders, 167
- multiculturalism, 96
- Musharraf, Pervez, 6, 11, 16, 44, 60–61, 84–85, 87, 94, 96, 99, 107, 137, 142, 147, 161, 169, 209–211, 217, 226, 228–229, 248
- Muslim Commercial Bank, 30
- Muslim Family Laws, 100
- Muslim League, 34, 39, 45–46, 61, 63, 163, 212, 226, 245
- mussali*, 187, 190. *See also* caste/castes
- Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal (MMA), 232
- Muttahida Qaumi Mahaz (MQM), 232
- Nai Kiran project, 245
- Napoleon, Louis, 219
- Naseer, F., 223
- National Accountability Bureau (NAB), 86

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi

Index

[More Information](#)

270

Index

- National Assembly, 5, 41, 205, 223, 231
 national commercial banks, nationalisation of, 28
 National Database and Registration Authority (NADRA), 122–123
 National Film Censorship Board, *ulemas* in, 246
 National Press Trust (NPT), 245–246
 national security, 11, 62, 66, 87, 89, 143
 nationalisations, 32, 165, 206
 nationalism, 2
 nation-states, 66, 133, 141
 natural resources, 68, 139, 146–147
 Navay Raje, 169–170; and Established Elite families, 171
Narwa-i-Waqt, 252
 Nazimuddin government, dismissal of, 40
 Nehru, Jawaharlal, 41, 46
 neo-classical counter-revolution, 14
 neo-colonial state, 56
 neoliberal policies, 145
 neoliberalising economy, 202
 neoliberalism, 3, 18, 21, 94, 98, 111
New Left Review, 3, 110–112
News, The, 250
 newspapers, 247; banning of, 246
 Niazi, Zamir, 245
 non-agricultural castes, 69
 non-governmental organisations, 65, 105
 Noon, Feroze Khan, 83
 nuclear programmes, 42
 NWFP, 29, 35, 38, 42, 46, 167, 205
 Okara peasant women's movement, 105.
See also under separate entries
 Oldenburg, Philip, 220
 Omvedt, Gail, 4
 Operation Zarb-e-Azb, 80, 106
 order, 5, 9, 12, 35, 42–43, 57, 62, 68–71, 78, 83, 101, 106–107, 111, 114, 116–117, 119, 123, 125, 159, 164, 179, 186, 188, 192, 210–211, 218, 221, 236, 242, 251; capitalism and, 78; dominant social, 188; political, 17, 57, 65, 67–71, 83, 111, 218; social, 62, 68–69, 159, 188, 192
 overdeveloped: colonial state, 35, 46, 49; postcolonial state, 5, 56; state, 1, 3–5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 22, 25–28, 30, 32, 34–36, 40, 44, 48–49, 65, 69, 75, 77–79, 110, 115, 120, 126, 139–141, 149, 187–188, 192, 194, 241, 244–247, 253
 paid activism, 8, 96. *See also* activism
 Pakhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party (PkMAP), 232
 Pakistan Administrative Services, 148
 Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation (Pakistan Radio), 246
 Pakistan Economic Association (PEA), 14
 Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA), 249–251
 Pakistan Industrial Credit and Investment Corporation (PICIC), 31
 Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PMLN), 61, 87, 89, 195, 203, 210, 212, 226, 234
 Pakistan National Alliance (PNA), 63, 205–8, 210–211
 Pakistan People's Party (PPP), 40–41, 58, 61, 83, 89, 179, 188, 195, 204–205, 207–209, 220, 226, 245
 Pakistan Radio. *See* Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation
 Pakistan Socialist Society, 2
 Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), 87, 212
 Pakistan Youth League, 2
 Pakistan, creation of, 252
 Panama Papers, 86
 Papanek, Gustav, 13
 Papanek, Hanna, 222
 para-military 6. *See also* military
 parties, 83, 229–233
 party: politics, 27, 46; tickets, 231, 234
 Pasha, 249

- Pashtoon/Pashtuns, 71, 252
 patriarchy, 56, 101, 103
 patronage, 7–8, 11–12, 41, 65, 67–71, 99, 145, 163, 167, 169, 179, 192, 194, 204, 207–212, 216–218, 220–236; based party system 235; politics 11–12, 71, 194, 208–209, 216–218, 220–221, 224, 228–230, 232–233, 235–236; private 7, 221
 patrons, 17, 68, 71, 123, 188, 191–192, 211, 216, 220–225, 231, 233
 peace talks, 100
 peasants, 2, 19, 81, 97, 183, 187, 190; castes, 177, 186–187, 190. *See also* caste/castes
 phenomenal categories, 126
 piety, 104, 203, 208
 Pinochet's Chile, 84
 planning, 33, 36–37, 165
 ploddy empiricism, 182
 policy: of cheap food, 44; neoliberal, 145; social, 16, 80; state, 27, 30, 35, 48–49, 210
 political: families, 161; order, colonial, 218; parties, 11, 40–41, 44–46, 49, 61, 76, 79, 83, 89, 93–94, 113, 123, 165, 179, 204, 206, 209, 216, 218, 226, 230–231, 233–234, 236; processes, 110, 136, 160, 172; socialisation, 45; subjection, 110–115, 121; system, 46, 132, 233, 242
 political development, 3, 78
 political economy: gendered reading of, 105–107; Indo-centric, 44; models, 111
 politicians, 8, 11–12, 19, 26, 40–41, 44–46, 62, 82, 85–86, 155, 157, 159, 167–168, 225, 230–231, 233–234
 politics, 2–3, 5, 7–8, 11–12, 17, 19–20, 22, 44–45, 56–57, 64–65, 67–71, 76, 82, 96–99, 101–102, 104–106, 116–117, 165, 169–170, 177, 188–192, 194, 201–202, 207–209, 211, 216–218, 220–222, 224–225, 228–230, 232–236; of common sense, 8, 17, 19, 71, 120, 125, 216, 232, 236; of dispossession, 21; dynastic, 224; Islamic, 97, 101–102; patron–client, 216; programmatic, 12, 234–235; rural, 177, 188–194; solidarity, 96; subordinate class, 58
 Pollin, Robert, 143–145
 postcolonial, 3–5, 9–11, 20, 25, 38, 42, 46, 56, 59, 148, 154, 156, 158–159, 188, 193, 218, 241; nations, 154, 158; societies, 3, 25, 241; state, 4–5, 9–10, 25–26, 42, 46, 56, 111–112, 115, 130–131, 133, 135–136, 139–143, 146, 149, 154, 156, 158–159, 218
 poverty, 15; alleviation of, 80
 power, 70, 218–220; accumulation of, 66, 228; allocation of, 160; autonomous, 218; bureaucratic, 37; contenders, 83; distributional approach, 219; dynamics of, 57, 143, 158, 162; economic, 19, 154, 161, 171, 179–180, 185, 191, 233; of elected representatives, 228; feudal, 43; fracturisation of, 10; landlord, 192; magisterial, 228–229; metropolitan, 10, 66; of military, 61, 143; social, 68, 181, 188, 224; socialisation of, 200; of state, 7, 39, 90, 133, 137, 148, 160, 171, 176, 219, 221, 225; state–society balance of, 78; structure of, 10, 57, 60, 62–63, 67–72, 172, 199; transfer of, 44, 89
 Presidential Ordinance 1963, 47
 Press Commission of Pakistan 1959, 244
 Press Information Department (PID), 244, 246
 Pritchett, L., 42
 privatisation, 48, 79
 production, 2, 5, 9, 14, 20, 31, 78, 83, 94, 113, 115, 117, 119–121, 126, 132, 135, 145–148, 154, 179, 182–183,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi

Index

[More Information](#)

272

Index

- 200, 203, 242; colonial mode of
2; means of, 146, 154, 182–183;
process of, 146–147
- Progressive Papers Limited (PPL), 245
- Propaganda Model, 243, 247–251
- property, 69, 182–183, 191, 219, 224
- propertyless mass, 68
- provinces, 21, 37–38, 61, 98, 137, 139–140,
159, 167, 180, 184, 188–189, 201,
205, 209, 223, 226–229, 231, 236,
245, 251; governments of, 7, 27,
39, 44, 225–229, 231, 233, 235; of
Muslim majority, 38
- Provincial Assemblies, 45, 208, 226
- Provincial Finance Commissions (PFCs),
22, 227, 231
- PTUF union, 47
- PTV, 246–247, 249; Islamification of, 246
- Public Works Department (PWD), 148
- Punjab, 5–6, 8, 19, 21–22, 29, 38, 41–42,
46, 59, 61, 63, 68, 99, 101–102,
137–140, 142, 161, 165–167, 177–
178, 180–182, 184–186, 188–191,
193–195, 200–206, 208–211, 221,
223–227, 229, 234, 251
- Punjab Alienation of Land Act 1900, 69
- Qadeer, M.A., 179, 189
- Qadir, A., 226
- Qayyum Muslim League, 35
- Quaid-i-Azam University, 14
- Radhu, G.M., 14
- radical leftists, 98
- Rajputs, 186, 190
- Rashid, Jamil, 15, 20
- Rawalpindi, 137, 251
- reforms, 9, 15, 40, 58, 102, 114, 144, 165,
178, 183, 223, 236; 1973, 59
- relative autonomy, 34, 36, 48, 77–78, 113,
192
- religion, instrumentalisation of, 104
- religio-political: groups, 160; movements,
8, 160–161. *See also* vigilante groups,
religiously motivated
- religious: leaders, 155; parties, 94, 102, 205,
232
- remittances, 64, 122. *See also* foreign direct
investment (FDI)
- rent-seeking, 5, 193, 208, 210, 212, 221,
228, 232, 234–235
- Repressive State Apparatuses (RSAs),
242–243
- resistance, 7–8, 10, 21, 76, 93, 120
- Resnick, Stephen, 131–132, 136
- Riaz, Sheikh Nadeem, 206
- Rodrick, Dani, 145
- Rouse, Shahnaz, 15
- Roy, Ananya, 143
- Rudra, Ashok, 4
- ruling: classes, 118, 153–155, 158–168,
171, 217–220, 223–224, 236, 243;
evolution of, 163; parties, 124, 221,
229, 231, 234. *See also under* class;
elite
- rural: aristocracy, 184, 186; development,
36, 42, 189; ‘middle-class’, 185;
social formation, 179, 194; society,
63, 67
- Sadiq, Khwaja, 206
- Saigol, 32
- Sainis, 187
- salariat*, 2
- Saul, John, 4, 9
- Sayeed, Asad, 3, 13, 187, 201, 220
- Sayeed, K.B., 77
- scholar-activists, 97
- scholarship, 1, 13–14, 16, 18, 21, 56, 59,
64, 77, 83, 93, 95, 97, 99, 106, 115,
117–118, 131, 154, 192
- secularisation, 97, 100
- segmentation 145, 177, 182–187; intra-class,
183; off-farm, 177, 179–180, 191
- Shafqat, Saeed, 223
- Shah Alam traders’ association, 208
- Shah, Aquil, 4, 6, 8, 11–12, 14, 40, 78, 84,
102, 143, 217
- Shahid-ur-Rahman, 156

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi

Index

[More Information](#)

Index

273

- Sharif, Nawaz, 61, 63, 83, 86–87
- Sharif, Raheel, 60
- Sharif, Shahbaz, 203
- Shehzad, Saleem, murder of, 88, 250
- Shivji, Issa, 4
- Shuja-ur-Rehman, Mian, 207
- shutter-down strikes, 206
- shutter-power, 211. *See also* resistance
- Siddiqua, Ayesha, 40, 43, 61–62, 217, 243
- Siddiqui, K., 251
- Sindh, 5, 21, 29, 35, 71, 83, 86, 123, 167–168, 195, 252; constructions of dams in, 43
- Sindh Tenancy Act of 1950, 27
- social: capital, 211, 224; class, 7, 9–10, 19, 21, 76–78, 81–82, 112, 149, 158, 172, 178; development, 102; formations, 10, 12, 19, 49, 67, 112, 114, 124, 178, 188; groups, 7, 21, 35, 59, 81, 186–188, 192, 194; mobility, 99, 107, 154, 169; movements, 192; relations, 112, 117, 125, 135, 146, 191, 200, 218–219; scientists, 4, 14–15, 18, 111, 124, 176; structures, 8, 67, 75–76, 160
- social media, 87, 244, 247–248. *See also* media
- society dynamics, 75, 81
- sociology, 2–3, 16, 18, 20
- Soviet arms, 34. *See also* China, arms supplies from
- spatiality, 8–9, 130–131, 133, 135–137, 139–141, 143–146, 149
- state, 1, 3–15, 17–22, 25–28, 30, 32–37, 40–50, 56–63, 65–69, 71, 75–82, 90, 93–96, 98–102, 104–105, 110–127, 130–133, 135–149, 153–154, 156–167, 171–172, 176–178, 186–188, 191–194, 199, 204–205, 216–226, 230–233, 241–247, 252–253; autonomy, 34–35; bureaucratic-military-dominated, 25; class character of, 221; colonial, 10, 26, 42, 59, 68, 141, 158, 186, 188; effects, 118; formation, 112, 116, 120, 135; functionaries, 62, 71, 204; history of the, 62; institutions, 7, 58, 60, 62, 75, 137, 146, 148–149, 176; of Martial Rule, 77; Marxian concept of modern, 78; media in praetorian, 242–244; mental space in, 11, 17, 135–137, 140, 142–143; militarised, 99; national security, 62; ‘oligarchy’, 154; overdeveloped, 11, 42; patronage, 221; physical space in, 135, 137, 139; pillars of, 248; praetorian, 94; as process, 131–133; reformulation of, 4; social space in, 135–137, 140
- State Bank of Pakistan, 14, 22
- state institutions, Pritchett on, 42
- state–media relations, 242, 244, 247, 252
- state–society: consensus, 62; relations, 75, 90, 191, 253
- state–spatiality, 133–135
- status, 35, 39, 41, 60, 84, 96, 103, 116, 154, 161–162, 167–168, 170–171, 177, 182, 185–186, 190–191, 203–204, 207, 211, 216, 232, 243; social, 170, 185. *See also* class
- steel frame, 37, 58–60, 62, 64
- Stepan, Michael, 4
- strike, 47–48, 105, 206
- Subaltern Studies, 21, 56, 99, 112, 119, 252
- Suhail, Adeem, 3–4, 7, 9, 19, 22, 79, 111
- Suharto’s Indonesia, 84
- Sulheria, 11, 17, 22
- Supreme Court, 42, 85–86
- Syeds, 186, 190
- Tablighi Jamaat, 102
- Taliban militants, 6, 79–80, 85, 100–102, 105–106, 250. *See also* militants/militant groups
- taxation, 6, 9, 27, 31, 36, 42, 132, 157, 163–164, 210, 227; agricultural, 184; direct, 27, 31; land, 42

- terrorism, 12, 20, 61
 textiles, 47
 Thelen, K., 219
 Therborn, Goran, 219
 Third World, 1
 Toba Tek Singh (TTS), 185, 187, 190–191
 tractor ownership, 29
 trade ban, 164
 traders, 5, 8, 12, 19, 21, 63, 157, 163–164, 167, 179, 191, 200–212, 220;
 as commercial actors, 200–201;
 migrating Hindu, 26; Muhajir, 164
 Trading Corporation of Pakistan, 204–205
 transformations, 134, 192, 199, 212, 241
 transnational corporations, 158–159
 transporters, 63, 191, 206
 Tudor, Maya, 11
 Two Nation Theory, 243–244
 two-turnover test, 89

 ul Haq, Mahbub, 156
 underdevelopment, 57, 115, 141
 uneven: development, 9, 137–138, 141–142; state-spatiality, 139–141, 144
 unions, 41, 46–48, 82, 166, 207–208, 242, 253
 university education, private sector, 16
 University Ordinance, 41
 urbanisation, 8, 64–65, 69, 75, 155, 171, 178, 181, 199, 201–202
 Urdu-speaking: political leadership, 30; upper caste elite, 163
 USAID, 16

 Vanaik, Achin, 4
 vigilante groups, religiously motivated, 162.
 See also shutter power; violence
 violence, 6, 76, 79–80, 105, 121, 126, 207; domestic, 102–103
 Vyborny, K., 221

 War on Terror, 16, 98–99, 101, 105
 Warrior State, 4, 35
 Waseem, M., 227

 Water and Power Development Agencies (WAPDAs), 37
 wealth, 27–28, 32, 36, 155–159, 162, 166, 169–172, 186, 191, 221, 226; disparities in, 157; redistribution of, 153
 Weber, Max, 60, 79, 116–117, 126, 182, 185
Weekly Mazdoor Jeddohud, 253
 Western Liberal Freedoms, 104
 Western modernity, 106
 White authority, 251–252. *See also* media
 White, L.J., 14, 222
 Wolff, Richard, 131–132, 136
 women, 2, 21, 45, 58, 70, 93–96, 98–107, 123, 145, 156, 170; in development work, 103; empowerment of, 107; groups, 93; and Islam, 95; middle- and lower-class, 95; movement by, 93, 95, 105; Musharraf era as decade of, 96; participation, 8, 96, 99; rights for, 94; rights movements, 94, 100, 106–107
 Women's Action Forum, 106
 workforce, 22, 70, 96, 144; women's participation in, 8
 working class, 15, 46, 96–97, 101–102, 105, 209, 253; militancy, 32, 46; movements, 15, 97, 99, 101, 105; movements suppression of, 32
 World Bank, 15, 17

 Yousafzai, Malala, 100–101

 Zaidi, S. Akbar, 5–7, 10, 12–13, 18–20, 22, 37, 56–57, 75–79, 81, 83–85, 87–88, 90, 93, 95–98, 106–107, 110, 130–131, 135–136, 141, 143–144, 146, 149, 160–162, 171, 176, 179–180, 223, 241–243, 247–248, 252–253; and Alavi's models, 110, 115; and women's empowerment, 107
zamindars, 187. *See also* landlords; landowners

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi
Index
[More Information](#)

Index

275

Zia ul Haq, 12, 20, 22, 48, 63, 69–71, 83, 86, 94, 96, 137, 159, 166–167, 169, 204, 207–209, 246; Akhtar on, 22; as anti-women dictator, 94; conservatism of, 93; coup in 1977, 41; industrialists and, 166; Islamisation and, 69, 94; martial law

of, 85; mobilisation of subordinate classes, 70; re-privatisation and, 166; regime of, 48, 69–71, 166, 169, 207; sacking Chief Justice, 41; urbanising Punjab and, 63
Zia, Afia S., 8–9, 17, 22